

Lesson 10: Text-Based Discussion: Evidence of Threats to Human Rights in Chapters 1–3 of *Esperanza Rising*



CCS Standards

- **RL.5.1:** Quote accurately from a text when explaining what the text says explicitly and when drawing inferences from the text.
- **RL.5.5:** Explain how a series of chapters, scenes, or stanzas fits together to provide the overall structure of a particular story, drama, or poem.
- **RI.5.1:** Quote accurately from a text when explaining what the text says explicitly and when drawing inferences from the text.
- **W.5.9:** Draw evidence from literary or informational texts to support analysis, reflection, and research.
 - a. Apply *grade 5 Reading standards* to literature (e.g., “Compare and contrast two or more characters, settings, or events in a story or a drama, drawing on specific details in the text [e.g., how characters interact]”).
 - b. Apply *grade 5 Reading standards* to informational texts (e.g., “Explain how an author uses reasons and evidence to support particular points in a text, identifying which reasons and evidence support which point[s]”).
- **SL.5.1:** Engage effectively in a range of collaborative discussions (one-on-one, in groups, and teacher-led) with diverse partners on *grade 5 topics and texts*, building on others’ ideas and expressing their own clearly.
 - a. Come to discussions prepared, having read or studied required material; explicitly draw on that preparation and other information known about the topic to explore ideas under discussion.
 - b. Follow agreed-upon rules for discussions and carry out assigned roles.
 - c. Pose and respond to specific questions by making comments that contribute to the discussion and elaborate on the remarks of others.
 - d. Review the key ideas expressed and draw conclusions in light of information and knowledge gained from the discussions.



Daily Learning Targets

- I can quote accurately from the text to make connections between *Esperanza Rising* and the UDHR. (RL.5.1, RI.5.1)
- I can prepare for and follow discussion norms to have an effective text-based discussion about evidence of threats to human rights in *Esperanza Rising*. (RL.5.1, RI.5.1, W.5.9a, SL.5.1a)

Ongoing Assessment

- Entrance Ticket: Story Structure (RL.5.5)
- Preparing for a Text-Based Discussion note-catcher (RL.5.1, RI.5.1, W.5.9a, SL.5.1a)
- Exit Ticket: Reflecting on the Text-Based Discussion (SL.5.1)

Agenda

1. Opening

- A. Entrance Ticket: Story Structure (5 minutes)
- B. Reviewing Learning Targets (5 minutes)

2. Work Time

- A. Preparing for a Text-Based Discussion (25 minutes)
- B. Participating in a Text-Based Discussion (15 minutes)

3. Closing and Assessment

- A. Exit Tickets (10 minutes)

4. Homework

- A. Accountable Research Reading. Select a prompt and respond in the front of your independent reading journal.

Teaching Notes

Purpose of lesson and alignment to standards:

- In this lesson, students prepare for and participate in a short text-based discussion in which they describe threats to human rights in Chapters 1–3 of *Esperanza Rising*, using both the *Esperanza Rising* text and the UDHR, and discuss how those threats made them feel. This is in preparation for the end of unit assessment in Lesson 12, in which students have the same discussion, but this time about Chapters 4–6 (RL.5.1, RI.5.1, W.5.9a, SL.5.1).
- At the beginning of the lesson, students complete an entrance ticket about how “Los Melones” fits into the overall structure of the story. This activity serves two purposes: Students will be answering the same question in exactly the same format on the End of Unit 1 Assessment about a different chapter of *Esperanza Rising*, and it is a lead-in to updating the Structure of *Esperanza Rising* anchor chart (RL.5.5).
- At the end of the lesson, students reflect on their performance in the discussion to suggest improvements for the next text-based discussion.
- Continue to use Goal 1 Conversation Cues to promote productive and equitable conversation.
- In this lesson, the habit of character focus is on working to become an ethical person. Students are introduced to the characteristics of empathy and compassion as they discuss how the threats to human rights make them feel. Students also continue to practice respect as they have a respectful collaborative discussion.
- The research reading that students complete for homework will help build both their vocabulary and knowledge pertaining to human rights. By participating in this volume of reading over a span of time, students will develop a wide base of knowledge about the world and the words that help describe and make sense of it.

How it builds on previous work:

- In the lessons leading up to this one, students have been analyzing threats to human rights in *Esperanza Rising* and recording them on a class anchor chart. The content of this anchor

chart is the starting point of the note-catcher they complete in preparation for the text-based discussion.

Areas in which students may need additional support:

- Students may need additional support working independently to prepare for the text-based discussion. Consider grouping students who will find this challenging with you and work through three chosen events in *Esperanza Rising* together—for example, the death of her father, the land being left to her uncle rather than her mother, and the house burning down.

Assessment guidance:

- Listen to student discussions and use the norms recorded on the Discussion Norms anchor chart to identify common issues to be used as whole group teaching points later on.
- Consider using the Collaborative Discussion Informal Checklist to assess students as they discuss to identify common issues (see Module 1 Appendix).
- Collect *Esperanza Rising*: Questions about “Los Melones” homework from Lesson 9. Refer to the *Esperanza Rising*: Questions about “Los Melones” (example, for teacher reference) as necessary (see supporting materials).

Down the road:

- In the next lesson, students will read the next chapter of *Esperanza Rising* and will prepare for the text-based discussion in the End of Unit 1 Assessment in Lesson 12.

In advance:

- Strategically pair students for work during this lesson, with at least one strong reader per pair.
- Review the Thumb-O-Meter protocol (see Classroom Protocols).
- Post: Learning targets and applicable anchor charts (see materials list).

Technology & Multimedia

- Opening A: Students complete entrance tickets online, in a Google Form, for example.
- Work Time A: Students complete note-catchers using a word-processing tool—for example, a Google Doc.
- Work Time A: Students complete their note-catchers in a word-processing document—for example, a Google Doc—using Speech to Text facilities activated on devices or using an app or software such as Dictation.io (<https://dictation.io/speech>).
- Work Time B: Record students as they engage in text-based discussions to listen to later to discuss strengths and what they could improve on or to use as models for the group. Most devices (cell phones, tablets, laptop computers) come equipped with free video and audio recording apps or software.
- Closing and Assessment A: Students complete exit tickets online—in a Google Form, for example.

Supporting English Language Learners

Supports guided in part by CA ELD Standards 5.I.A.1, 5.I.A.3, 5.I.A.4, 5.I.B.5, 5.I.B.6, 5.I.B.8, 5.I.C.11, 5.II.A.1, and 5.II.A.2

Important points in the lesson itself

- The basic design of this lesson supports ELLs by continuing the pattern of analysis of *Esperanza Rising* using the Structure of *Esperanza Rising* anchor chart and building from the How Were the Human Rights of the Characters in *Esperanza Rising* Threatened? anchor chart to make connections to the UDHR. Moreover, students have the opportunity to synthesize their learning during a text-based discussion. This format is ideal for language development, as it invites students to negotiate with classmates about the meaning of what they are trying to say, pushing them to change their language to be more comprehensible. Additionally, students can celebrate their successful attempts at communication and their ability to extend and enhance the discussions, using language from the Discussion Norms anchor chart, for example.
- ELLs may find the text-based discussion challenging, as the spotlight is trained more on them. Encourage all communication from ELLs as successful risk-taking, allowing them to grapple but rephrasing what they say if necessary, and remind them to rely on the language tools provided during this and previous lessons (see Meeting Students' Needs column).

Levels of support

For lighter support:

- Invite a student to paraphrase the key points of Article 13 from the Mid-Unit 1 Assessment in more comprehensible language to make sure those who need heavier support are ready to continue.
- Encourage students to modify the graphic organizer they began in Lesson 2 to track (and illustrate) the main events of *Esperanza Rising* against the structure of the story. Ask them how they might incorporate their feelings. Invite them to explain their modified graphic organizer to students who need heavier support.

For heavier support:

- Transform the investigation of the Preparing for a Text-Based Discussion note-catcher into a kinesthetic activity. Copy completed cells of the note-catcher onto separate cards or sticky notes. Students can paste the cards into the correct location on the note-catcher.
- Consider using the Preparing for a Text-Based Discussion note-catcher (example, for teacher reference) or the student's completed copy to help students voice their opinion during the text-based discussion. Point to the information in the note-catcher as you express the student's opinion in the simplest meaningful language possible and invite the student to then point and repeat after you or make any corrections. Check the student's intended meaning with Conversation Cues such as: "So, do you mean ____?"

Universal Design for Learning

- **Multiple Means of Representation (MMR):** This lesson introduces text-based discussion. Establish explicit expectations and habits in this lesson and provide multiple representations of your expectations during text-based discussion. For instance, model and think aloud a discussion group with a few proficient students. For visual representations, refer to the anchor charts, note-catchers, and discussion frames when modeling.
- **Multiple Means of Action and Expression (MMAE):** Students who may need additional support with expressive language can benefit from scaffolds that facilitate communication. Consider having intermediate students create sentence frames that are appropriate for text-based discussions. Then, students who need more support can refer to these frames during the discussion.
- **Multiple Means of Engagement (MME):** Because this is the first lesson centered on text-based discussion, it is important to remind students that this is only the first of a series of lessons to help build their skills. Create a supportive and inclusive classroom environment by reminding students that everyone is working toward getting better at class discussions. Highlight and provide specific positive feedback on growth and development rather than relative performance.

Vocabulary

Key:

(L): Lesson-Specific Vocabulary

(T): Text-Specific Vocabulary

(W): Vocabulary Used in Writing

- text-based discussion, empathy, compassion (L)

Materials

- ✓ Entrance Ticket: Story Structure (one per student and one to display)
- ✓ Entrance Ticket: Story Structure (example, for teacher reference)
- ✓ Structure of *Esperanza Rising* anchor chart (begun in Lesson 2; added to during Opening A)
- ✓ Structure of *Esperanza Rising* anchor chart (example, for teacher reference)
- ✓ Preparing for a Text-Based Discussion note-catcher (one per student and one to display)
- ✓ Preparing for a Text-Based Discussion note-catcher (example, for teacher reference)
- ✓ Working to Become Ethical People anchor chart (begun in Lesson 2; added to during Work Time A; see supporting materials)
- ✓ Working to Become Ethical People anchor chart (example, for teacher reference)
- ✓ How Were the Human Rights of the Characters in *Esperanza Rising* Threatened? anchor chart (begun in Lesson 4)
- ✓ Quoting Accurately from the Text handout (from Lesson 5; one per student and one to display)
- ✓ *Esperanza Rising* (from Lesson 2; one per student)
- ✓ Simplified version of the UDHR (from Lesson 4; one per student)

- ✓ Discussion Norms anchor chart (begun in Lesson 1)
- ✓ Discussion Norms anchor chart (example, for teacher reference)
- ✓ Exit Ticket: Reflecting on the Text-Based Discussion (one per student)

Opening

A. Entrance Ticket: Story Structure (5 minutes)

- Move students into pairs and invite them to label themselves A and B.
- Distribute and display the **Entrance Ticket: Story Structure**.
- Read aloud the question in the second column for students and remind them of the key at the top of the **Structure of Esperanza Rising anchor chart**.
- Invite students to discuss with their partner and then record on their entrance ticket:
“Using the key on the Structure of Esperanza Rising anchor chart, where does this chapter fit into the overall structure of the text? What makes you think so?” (We know that more things are likely to happen to Esperanza and her mother because they have only just arrived in the United States. There hasn’t been a turning point yet.)
- Cold call students to share out. Refer to **Entrance Ticket: Story Structure (example, for teacher reference)** as necessary.
- As students share out, capture their responses on the Structure of *Esperanza Rising* anchor chart. Refer to **Structure of Esperanza Rising anchor chart (example, for teacher reference)** as necessary.
- Remind students that the climax of the story is a turning point, and that everything that has happened so far in the story has been bad for Esperanza; hopefully the turning point will be when good things start to happen for her.

Meeting Students’ Needs

- For ELLs and students who may need additional support with memory: Ask:
“What is the series of conflicts and crises in this chapter leading toward climax? What do you think will happen next?” (Esperanza and her family are allowed into the U.S. as others are being sent back to Mexico; they arrive in Los Angeles and meet Alfonso’s brother’s family; Esperanza learns more about life and segregation in the U.S. as a migrant worker; she becomes closer to Miguel as she feels more and more adrift; she comes face-to-face with her own classism.) (MMR)
- For ELLs and students who may need additional support with memory: In preparation for the End of Unit 1 Assessment, invite students who need lighter support to paraphrase a paragraph frame to those who need heavier support to explain why a chapter fits into the rising action. (Example: Rising action: This chapter is part of the rising action. We know that more things are likely to happen to Esperanza and her mother because they have only just arrived in the United States. They are experiencing a series of conflicts and crises leading toward climax, such as _____. There hasn’t been a turning point yet.) (MMR)

Opening

B. Reviewing Learning Targets (5 minutes)

- Direct students' attention to the posted learning targets and select a volunteer to read them aloud:
 - *“I can quote accurately from the text to make connections between Esperanza Rising and the UDHR.”*
 - *“I can prepare and follow discussion norms to have an effective text-based discussion about evidence of threats to human rights in Esperanza Rising.”*
- Underline the words *text-based discussion*. Invite students to turn and talk to their partner, and then cold call students to share out:
 - “What is a text-based discussion?” (a discussion based on text)*
- Ask students to discuss with their partner, and then cold call students to share with the whole group:
 - “Based on these learning targets, what do you think you will be doing in this lesson?” (make connections between the UDHR and Esperanza Rising and prepare for and participate in a text-based discussion about threats to human rights in Esperanza Rising)*

Meeting Students' Needs

- For ELLs and students who may need additional support with memory: Repeat, rephrase, and display the rephrased version of the final two learning targets next to the originals. (Example: I can talk with my group about examples in *Esperanza Rising* that show human rights being threatened. I can use the Discussion Norms anchor chart to help our group be successful.) (MMR)

Work Time

A. Preparing for a Text-Based Discussion (25 minutes)

- Distribute and display the **Preparing for a Text-Based Discussion note-catcher**.
- Read the questions at the top of the note-catcher aloud for the group.
- First, point out that the note-catcher involves only the first three chapters and that those chapters are listed below the questions, since the book's chapters are not numbered.
- Next, focus students on the second part of the question. Help them see that they will record this information in the final column, which is not on the anchor chart.
- Focus students on the **Working to Become Ethical People anchor chart**.
- Remind students that sometimes the things we discuss in class or the texts we read can upset some students. Explain that sometimes this can come as a result of their previous experiences or their family background. Remind them that they have already been working hard on practicing respect to be respectful of this.

- Invite students to Think-Pair-Share, leaving adequate time for each partner to think, to ask each other the question, and share. Cold call students to share out:
“When someone is upset about something, how does it make you feel? What can you do to help that person work through it?” (show empathy and compassion)
- If productive, cue students to expand the conversation by giving an example:
“Can you give an example?” (Responses will vary.)
- Tell students that you want to focus on two of those strategies for being an ethical person. Add the following to the anchor chart:
 - “I show empathy. This means I understand and share or take into account the feelings, situation, or attitude of others.”
 - “I show compassion. This means I notice when others are sad or upset and try to help them.”
- Refer to **Working to Become Ethical People anchor chart (example, for teacher reference)** as necessary.
- Invite students to Think-Pair-Share, leaving adequate time for partners to think, to ask each other the question, and share. Cold call students to share their responses with the whole group:
“In your own words, what does this mean?” (to try to understand how others feel)
“When someone shows empathy, what does it look like? What will you see?”
“When someone shows empathy, what does it sound like? What will you hear?”
- As students share out, capture their responses in the appropriate columns of the Working to Become Ethical People anchor chart. Refer to the Working to Become Ethical People anchor chart (example for teacher reference) as needed.
- Ask students to turn and talk, and then cold call students to share out:
“In your own words, what does this mean?” (to notice when someone is upset and to try to help them)
“When someone shows compassion, what does it look like? What will you see?”
“When someone shows compassion, what does it sound like? What will you hear?”
- Refer to the Working to Become Ethical People anchor chart (example for teacher reference) as needed.
- Add *empathy* and *compassion* to the Academic Word Wall. Invite students to add translations of the words in their home languages in a different color next to the target vocabulary.
- Point out to students that there are only three rows on the Preparing for a Text-Based Discussion note-catcher. This is because they are going to choose three examples of threats to human rights in Chapters 1–3 that were particularly meaningful to them. Explain that this means they will have had an emotional response, such as anger, disgust, disappointment, sadness. Explain that this emotional response could come from their own experiences or just as a reaction to the text.
- Ensure students understand that they also need to be able to justify why they feel the way they feel.
- Remind students to use the **How Were the Human Rights of the Characters in *Esperanza Rising* Threatened? anchor chart** as a starting point, as this lists many of the threats to human rights that they have already identified.

- Model an example as a think-aloud. Refer to **Preparing for a Text-Based Discussion Note-catcher (example, for teacher reference)** as necessary.
- Emphasize that students can focus on things that are not listed on the anchor chart as long as they have evidence from both *Esperanza Rising* and the UDHR to support their claims.
- Invite students to retrieve their **Quoting Accurately from the Text handout** and remind them to use it to quote accurately from *Esperanza Rising* and the **simplified version of the UDHR**. Tell them that if they wish to use the actual articles of the UDHR that they have closely read rather than the simplified versions, this is also fine, as long as they quote accurately from the text and make clear connections to characters in *Esperanza Rising*.
- Tell students they have the option of working alone or with a partner. Emphasize that as this contains a personal response, students may wish to do this alone, but invite those who want to work with someone to move to a certain area of the room to pair up with someone else who wants to work with a partner.
- Invite students to begin working.
- Circulate to support students in completing their note-catcher.
- Tell students they are now going to use the Thumb-O-Meter protocol to reflect on their progress toward the first learning target. Remind them that they used this protocol in Lesson 7 and review as necessary. Refer to the Classroom Protocols document for the full version of the protocol.
- Guide students through the Thumb-O-Meter protocol using the first learning target. Scan the responses and make a note of students who may need more support with this moving forward.

Meeting Students' Needs

- For ELLs and students who may need additional support with new vocabulary: Consider adding simpler synonyms to the Word Wall in a lighter color next to the target vocabulary. (Example: *care*) (MMR)
- For ELLs and students who may need additional support with comprehension: Buy or ask for large paint chips from a local hardware or paint store or print them online. Write synonyms such as *compassion*, *empathy*, *sympathy*, *pity*, *care*, and *understanding*, each one on a different shade of the paint chip. Place them on the wall and discuss the shades of meaning in relation to the strategies for being an ethical person. (MMR)
- For ELLs and students who may need additional support with comprehension: Consider inviting students to complete the Preparing for a Text-Based Discussion note-catcher in somewhat reverse order, drawing on their most intense negative feelings from *Esperanza Rising* and then identifying which events in the story sparked those feelings. (MMAE)
- For ELLs: Consider inviting students to verbally "complete" the note-catcher in home language groupings, focusing more on the discussion of emotions, events, and connections to human rights, rather than on writing. They can then focus on writing notes in their home language or English, or making sketches as placeholders, and finally discussing in English.

- For ELLs and students who may need additional support with expressive language: To provide lighter support, invite intermediate students to create a discussion frame to bolster participation during the discussion. (MMAE)
 - Help them notice how they can create cohesion in the frame by referring back and forward using language like pronouns or nominalizations instead of repeating the same information each time they make a reference. (See coded language in the example below.)
 - Ask them to discuss how this discussion frame is different from their everyday discussions with classmates and how it is different from the formal writing summary they have done in this unit.
 - Invite students who need heavier support to use the frames. (MMAE)

Example:

- In ____ (name of chapter), ____ (description of *Esperanza Rising* event). On page ____, it says "____" (quote from *Esperanza Rising* describing event). This threatens the "____" (human right) in Article _____. ____ (*Esperanza Rising* event) made me feel ____ because ____.
- *In Las Uvas, Papa is killed by bandits. On page 22, it says, "... Esperanza could see a body in back, completely covered with a blanket." This threatens the "right to life" in Article 3. Papa's death made me feel angry because his death was so unfair.*
- For ELLs and students who may need additional support with memory: Review the second learning target introduced in Opening A. Ask students to give specific examples of how they worked toward achieving it in Work Time A. Invite students to rephrase the target now that they have more experience preparing for a text-based discussion.

Work Time

B. Participating in a Text-Based Discussion (15 minutes)

- Direct students' attention to the Discussion Norms anchor chart and review its criteria, specifically the cues and responses.
- Add "I prepare for the discussion" to the top of the anchor chart. Refer to **Discussion Norms anchor chart (example, for teacher reference)** as necessary.
- Move students into groups of five and invite them to sit in a circle or around a table with their group and their Preparing for a Text-Based Discussion note-catcher.
- Remind students of the question for the discussion at the top of the note-catcher.
- Explain that you want groups to ensure that all members contribute to the conversation.
- Focus students on the Working to Become Ethical People anchor chart. Tell students that as they will be having a collaborative discussion that includes describing how they feel, it is important that they practice respect, empathy, and compassion.
- Invite students to begin.
- Circulate to listen to students' discussions and make note of any common issues that could be used as teaching points.

Meeting Students' Needs

- For ELLs and students who may need additional support with expressive language: Model and think aloud a discussion group with a few proficient students. Refer to the anchor charts, note-catchers, and discussion frames as you model. (MMR)
- Provide sentence frames to help students with their expressive language skills. (MMAE)
- Consider handing out numbers so students know the order in which they will speak. This will help to reduce anxiety and help them be prepared for their turn. (MMAE)
- For ELLs: As students interact, jot down samples of effective communication. Also jot down one or two common language errors you hear (pervasive, stigmatizing, critical). If you record the discussion, invite students to listen and identify comprehensible communication and any errors. Share additional observations with the class. Allow students to take pride in the effective communication and correct the errors. For example, if students frequently omit subjects, display a sample and invite them to discuss what's missing. (Example: "Threatens the 'right to life' in Article 3." The subject, "Papa's murder," is missing.)

It's not necessary to identify who communicated well or who made errors. However, consider pulling the student aside to make it clear.

Closing and Assessment

A. Exit Ticket (10 minutes)

- Refocus whole group.
- Distribute and display the **Exit Ticket: Reflecting on the Text-Based Discussion**.
- Read aloud the questions on the exit ticket.
- Invite students to refer to the Discussion Norms anchor chart and the Working to Become Ethical People anchor chart to determine what they did well and what they could improve on next time.
- If there were common strengths or issues that you heard across the whole group, consider using this time to point them out and encourage students to record these as things to work on.
- Invite students to complete their exit ticket.
- Circulate to support students as they record their ideas.
- Ensure that students keep this exit ticket to refer to in Lesson 12.

Meeting Students' Needs

- Create a supportive and inclusive classroom environment by reminding students that everyone is working toward getting better at class discussions. Be sure to highlight and praise growth and development rather than relative performance. (MME)

Homework

A. Accountable Research Reading. Select a prompt and respond in the front of your independent reading journal.

Meeting Students' Needs

- For ELLs and students who may need additional support with reading and writing: Refer to the suggested homework support in Lesson 2. (MMAE, MMR)