

## Lesson 10: Peer Critique: Revising for Purpose



### CCS Standards

- **W.3.2:** Write informative/explanatory texts to examine a topic and convey ideas and information clearly.
- **W.3.2a:** Introduce a topic and group related information together; include illustrations when useful to aiding comprehension.
- **W.3.2b:** Develop the topic with facts, definitions, and details.
- **W.3.2c:** Use linking words and phrases (e.g., *also*, *another*, *and*, *more*, *but*) to connect ideas within categories of information.
- **W.3.2d:** Provide a concluding statement or section.
- **W.3.4:** With guidance and support from adults, produce writing in which the development and organization are appropriate to task and purpose.
- **W.3.5:** With guidance and support from peers and adults, develop and strengthen writing as needed by planning, revising, and editing.
- **SL.3.1:** Engage effectively in a range of collaborative discussions (one-on-one, in groups, and teacher-led) with diverse partners on *grade 3 topics and texts*, building on others' ideas and expressing their own clearly.
- **SL.3.1a:** Come to discussions prepared, having read or studied required material; explicitly draw on that preparation and other information known about the topic to explore ideas under discussion.
- **SL.3.1b:** Follow agreed-upon rules for discussions (e.g., gaining the floor in respectful ways, listening to others with care, speaking one at a time about the topics and texts under discussion).
- **SL.3.1c:** Ask questions to check understanding of information presented, stay on topic, and link their comments to the remarks of others.
- **SL.3.1d:** Explain their own ideas and understanding in light of the discussion.
- **L.3.2:** Demonstrate command of the conventions of standard English capitalization, punctuation, and spelling when writing.
- **L.3.2a:** Capitalize appropriate words in titles.
- **L.3.2b:** Use commas in addresses.
- **L.3.2c:** Use commas and quotation marks in dialogue.
- **L.3.2d:** Form and use possessives.
- **L.3.2e:** Use conventional spelling for high-frequency and other studied words and for adding suffixes to base words (e.g., *sitting*, *smiled*, *cries*, *happiness*).
- **L.3.2f:** Use spelling patterns and generalizations (e.g., *word families*, *position-based spellings*, *syllable patterns*, *ending rules*, *meaningful word parts*) in writing words.
- **L.3.2g:** Consult reference materials, including beginning dictionaries, as needed to check and correct spellings.



### Daily Learning Targets

- I can give kind, helpful, and specific feedback to my partner. (W.3.5, SL.3.1b)
- I can critique the purpose of writing in my partner's informative paragraph. (W.3.2a, W.3.2b, W.3.4, W.3.5, SL.3.1b)
- I can edit my writing for correct spelling, capitalization, and punctuation. (W.3.5, L.3.2)

### Ongoing Assessment

- Informative paragraph draft (W.3.2a, W.3.2b, W.3.4, W.3.5, SL.3.1b, L.3.2)

### Agenda

1. **Opening**
  - A. Engaging the Writer (5 minutes)
  - B. Reviewing Learning Targets (5 minutes)
2. **Work Time**
  - A. Peer Critique: Purpose (15 minutes)
  - B. Independent Practice: Revising Paragraphs (15 minutes)
  - C. Guided Practice: Editing for Conventions (15 minutes)
3. **Closing and Assessment**
  - A. Pair Share (5 minutes)
4. **Homework**
  - A. Respond to an informative writing prompt in your Unit 2 homework.
  - B. Accountable Research Reading. Select a prompt and respond in the front of your independent reading journal.

### Teaching Notes

#### Purpose of lesson and alignment to standards:

- Similar to the previous lesson, students use the Peer Critique protocol to provide feedback to partners on the purpose of their informative paragraph. Students then use their partners' feedback from this lesson and Lesson 9 to revise their paragraphs. Last, students edit their paragraphs for conventions. (W.3.2a, W.3.2b; W.3.4, W.3.5, SL.3.1b, L.3.2)
- Continue to reinforce the habits of character introduced in Unit 1, particularly as students give and receive peer critique.
- The research reading that students complete for homework will help build both their vocabulary and knowledge pertaining to overcoming challenges in access to education, books, and reading near and far. By participating in this volume of reading over a span of time, students will develop a wide base of knowledge about the world and the words that help describe and make sense of it.

#### How it builds on previous work:

- Students use what they know about the characteristics of informational texts to critique one another's informative paragraph drafts.
- Throughout Unit 1, students were introduced to various total participation techniques (e.g., cold calling, equity sticks, Turn and Talk, Think-Pair-Share, etc.). When following the directive "Using a total participation technique, invite responses from the group," use one of these techniques or another familiar technique to encourage all students to participate.
- Continue to use Goal 1 Conversation Cues to promote productive and equitable conversation.

#### Areas where students may need additional support:

- Much of this lesson is discussion-based, so students who struggle with oral language and/or auditory processing may need additional support. Consider providing sentence frames for students to refer to during discussions or a note-taking template for students to take notes during discussion.

#### Assessment guidance:

- Consider using the Writing Informal Assessment: Observational Checklist for Writing and Language Skills (grade 3) to informally assess the writing process in Work Time B.
- Consider using the Speaking and Listening Informal Assessment: Collaborative Discussion Checklist during the Peer Critique protocol in Work Time B.

#### Down the road:

- Students will plan, draft, revise, and edit a new informative paragraph for the End of Unit 2 Assessment in the next lesson.

#### In advance:

- Predetermine pairs for Work Time A.
- Review the Thumb-O-Meter protocol. (Refer to the Classroom Protocols document for the full version of the protocol.)
- Ask a student if he or she is willing to share his or her writing to help model the Peer Critique protocol.
- Post: Learning targets and Peer Critique anchor chart.

#### Technology & Multimedia

- Work Time B: Audio critique: Students record their partners' ideas and feedback in audio through free software or apps such as Audacity (<http://audacity.sourceforge.net>) or GarageBand (<http://www.apple.com/mac/garageband/>).
- Work Time B: Students use the highlighting and comments features on word-processing software to make suggestions on the work of peers.

## Supporting English Language Learners

Supports guided in part by CA ELD Standards 3.I.A.1, 3.I.B.5, 3.I.A.4, and 3.I.C.10

### Important points in the lesson itself

- The basic design of this lesson supports ELLs with opportunities to practice using oral language in a structured and supportive environment. It also helps create habits of self-correction and revision, which foster skills that will facilitate English language development.
- ELLs may find it challenging to provide peer feedback if they have trouble comprehending and using the language itself to understand their partners' writing. Model the process of providing feedback and offer opportunities to work together with students to think through the process. Students will benefit from developing this habit even if it is initially obscure.

### Levels of support

*For lighter support:*

- Provide students with only one or two prewritten sticky notes and several blank notes. Once they have used the prewritten notes, they will be challenged to make their own.

*For heavier support:*

- During Work Time A, display a non-example of a paragraph that lacks focus and whose related information is not grouped together. Model identifying the sentences that could use work on purpose and think aloud ways that the paragraph can be improved. Invite students to help improve the sentence by offering suggestions. Provide suggestions for common improvements related to purpose, such as "Cross out this sentence" or "Say how this is about the focus statement."

## Universal Design for Learning

- **Multiple Means of Representation:** This lesson builds on the peer critique experience students had in Lesson 9. All students will need explicit instruction on how to provide supportive, yet constructive feedback, but those who struggle with social skills may need additional support. Offer explicit examples of how to personify the Peer Critique norms. Consider creating a list of appropriate comments or offer sentence starters or role-playing during the modeled process in Work Time A.
- **Multiple Means of Action and Expression:** Students need to comprehend their partner's feedback to implement it. This may take some students longer than others. Consider providing extra time and scaffolds such as a brief conference or a revision checklist that includes a list of the tasks they need to complete during revision.
- **Multiple Means of Engagement:** Students who may need additional support with writing may feel uncomfortable sharing their writing with peers and receiving feedback. Create an inclusive and supportive classroom environment by emphasizing that everyone is working toward different writing goals. Place emphasis on growth rather than relative performance.

### Vocabulary

#### Key:

- (L): Lesson-Specific Vocabulary
- (T): Text-Specific Vocabulary
- (W): Vocabulary Used in Writing

- conventions, purpose(L)

### Materials

- ✓ Peer Critique anchor chart (begun in Unit 1, Lesson 10)
- ✓ Working to Become Ethical People anchor chart (begun in Unit 1, Lesson 2)
- ✓ Informational Texts handout (from Lesson 7; one per student and one to display)
- ✓ Student informative paragraph draft (optional; one to display; see Teaching Notes)
- ✓ Kenya paragraph draft (from Lesson 9; one to display)
- ✓ Sticky notes (several per student)
- ✓ Informative paragraph draft (begun in Lesson 8; revised during Work Times B and C; one per student)
- ✓ Spelling, Capitalization, and Punctuation handout (from Unit 1, Lesson 10; one per student and one to display)
- ✓ Orange highlighters (one per student)

### Opening

#### A. Engaging the Writer (5 minutes)

- Direct students' attention to the **Peer Critique anchor chart**. Tell them that today they will work with a new partner to give and receive feedback about their informative paragraphs.
- Direct students' attention to the norms at the top of the anchor chart:
  - “Be kind.”
  - “Be specific.”
  - “Be helpful.”
  - “Participate.”
- Using a total participation technique, invite responses from the group:
  - “Which norm do you feel you did well with during the critique in the previous lesson? Why?” (Responses will vary.)*
  - “Which norm will you focus on during today’s critique? What is one specific thing you will do today as you focus on that norm?” (Responses will vary.)*
- Focus students on the **Working to Become Ethical People anchor chart** and remind students that ethical people who treat others well and stand up for what is right. Review the habits of character on the chart. Remind students that to effectively critique their partner’s writing, they will need to remember these habits of character and what it looks and sounds like to practice them.

### Meeting Students' Needs

- For ELLs and students who may need additional support with memory: Provide an example of effective use of norms by identifying a student who exemplified one of the norms during the previous lesson. (Example: "Yesterday, I saw Fareeha being so helpful. Frances wasn't sure what else to write with the purple pencil, and Fareeha, very respectfully, gave her a very helpful suggestion.") (MMR)
- If you used a chart with examples of feedback that follow the Peer Critique protocol in Lesson 9, solicit examples from students and add to the list based on the previous lesson. (MMR)

## Opening

### B. Reviewing Learning Targets (5 minutes)

- Direct students' attention to the posted learning targets and select a volunteer to read them aloud:

***"I can give kind, helpful, and specific feedback to my partner."***

***"I can critique the purpose of writing in my partner's informative paragraph."***

***"I can edit my writing for correct spelling, capitalization, and punctuation."***

- Point to the first target. Using a total participation technique, invite responses from the group:

***"What is an example of kind, helpful, and specific feedback you can give to someone? What is a non-example?" (Responses will vary, but an example includes: You have a clear introduction that gives the reader interesting information about your expert group's country. Your conclusion sentence, though, does not relate back to the focus statement. Non-example: Your focus statement is bad. Your writing is disorganized.)***

- Point to the second target and tell students that today they will give and receive critique about the *purpose* of their paragraphs.
- Remind students that they thought about the purpose of their paragraphs as they planned and drafted by thinking about what the focus of their writing would be and what information should be grouped together. Point out that if their paragraph does not have a clear purpose, their reader will have a difficult time understanding the main idea.
- Direct students' attention to the last learning target. Tell them that after they revise their paragraphs, they will edit their paragraphs for *conventions*: correct spelling, capitalization, and punctuation. Review these terms as needed.

### Meeting Students' Needs

- For ELLs and students who may need additional support with memory or comprehension: Invite two students to role-play one example and one non-example of offering kind, helpful, and specific feedback. This will help provide a concrete example of the attitude and behavior expected throughout the lesson. Refer to the chart of examples if applicable. (MMR)



## Work Time

### A. Peer Critique: Purpose (15 minutes)

- Invite students to take out their **Informational Texts handout**. Ask them to silently reread the handout and identify which bullet point(s) they should refer to for today's critique on purpose. (the fourth bullet point: Informational texts are focused on the same topic throughout the piece; the eighth bullet point: Informational texts group related information together to explain a main idea.)
- Model the Peer Critique protocol process using the **student informative paragraph draft** or the **Kenya paragraph draft**:
  - Tell students they are going to hear the draft read aloud. As they listen, they should think about the feedback they might provide the author, using the sentence stems on the Peer Critique anchor chart.
  - Invite the student volunteer to slowly read aloud his or her paragraph.
  - Invite other students to provide feedback on the purpose of the paragraph.
  - As students share feedback, actively refine their praises and suggestions to make them as kind, helpful, and specific as possible.
  - Model making revision notes on the displayed draft based on the critique. Explain that students will make these revision notes to their own drafts after they participate in the protocol.
- Distribute **sticky notes** and remind students that as they listen to their partner read his or her paragraph, they will document their feedback on sticky notes.
- Invite students to take out their **informative paragraph draft** and move into predetermined pairs.
- Focus students on the Peer Critique anchor chart and remind them to use this anchor chart as a guide as they participate in the protocol.
- Guide students through the Peer Critique protocol.
- Circulate to support partners as they exchange feedback. Remind students to follow the discussion norms and to focus on giving feedback about how the paragraph is organized.
- Refocus whole group.
- Tell students they are going to use the Thumb-O-Meter protocol to reflect on their progress toward the first two learning targets. Remind them that they participated in this protocol in the previous lesson and review as necessary. (Refer to the Classroom Protocols document for the full version of the protocol.)
- Guide students through the Thumb-O-Meter protocol using the first two learning targets. Note students showing a thumb-sideways or thumb-down, so you can check in with them.

### Meeting Students' Needs

- For ELLs and students who may need additional support with writing: Provide prewritten sticky notes containing phrases that would commonly apply to writing feedback. This will allow students who may be challenged to think of and write feedback to choose the most comments for their partners. Examples:
  - "Can you explain this more?"
  - "What is the challenge?"
  - "Great example!" (MMAE)
- For ELLs: Pair students with a partner who has more advanced or native language proficiency. The partner with greater language proficiency can serve as a model in the pair, initiating discussions and offering feedback suggestions.
- Provide differentiated mentors by purposefully pre-selecting student partnerships. Consider meeting with the mentors in advance to encourage them to share their thought processes with their partner. (MMAE)
- Consider allowing some students to read their partner's informative paragraph ahead of time or provide extra time. This will allow them ample time to process the text and formulate appropriate feedback. (MMAE)

## Work Time

---

### B. Independent Practice: Revising Paragraphs (15 minutes)

- Tell students that they are now ready to revise their paragraphs.
- Model using feedback and revision notes to revise the student informative paragraph draft or the Kenya paragraph draft.
- Answer clarifying questions.
- Invite students to revise their drafts based on feedback from today and yesterday.
- Circulate to confer and support students as needed. Consider using this time to check in with students who showed a thumb-sideways or –down in Work Time A.
- After 15 minutes, refocus whole group.

### Meeting Students' Needs

- For ELLs and students who may need additional support with writing: Support students in choosing which revisions to make. If it is not possible for students to address all possible revisions, focus on revising anything that obscures the meaning or purpose of the paragraph. (MMAE)
- Provide extra time as necessary for students to write down and comprehend the peer feedback that they received before revising their informative paragraph. (MMAE)



## Work Time

### C. Guided Practice: Editing for Conventions (15 minutes)

- Tell students that as the last step in writing their paragraphs, they will edit for conventions. Explain that this means looking for and correcting errors in spelling, capitalization, and punctuation.
- Display and invite students to take out their **Spelling, Capitalization, and Punctuation handout**, and invite a volunteer to read the criteria aloud.
- Invite students to add any criteria they think are missing.
- Read aloud the first three sentences from the Kenya paragraph draft. Model editing for conventions by adding a period after the first sentence (between challenge and Kenya), capitalizing Kenya and Africa, and correcting the spelling of *dessert* to *desert*.
- Distribute **orange highlighters** and post these directions:
  1. With your partner, choose one of your informative paragraphs to read together.
  2. Read the paragraph together by one person reading aloud or whisper-reading together.
  3. Work together to highlight any capitalization, punctuation, or spelling errors.
  4. Revise the errors.
  5. Repeat steps 1–4 with the other informative paragraph.
- Invite students to work with their partner to edit their paragraphs. Circulate to confer and support as needed.
- Tell students they are going to use the Thumb-O-Meter protocol to reflect on their progress toward the last learning target.
- Guide students through the Thumb-O-Meter protocol using the learning target. Note students showing a thumb-sideways or thumb-down, so you can check in with them before the end of unit assessment in the next lesson. Repeat, inviting students to self-assess against how well they showed respect, empathy, compassion, and integrity in this lesson.

### Meeting Students' Needs

- For ELLs and students who may need additional support with writing: Encourage students to use the Spelling, Capitalization, and Punctuation handout from Unit 1 to help them identify and edit mechanical errors. (MMR)
- To help students self-regulate, provide them with a checklist including the directions for editing their conventions. Remind them to look for capitalization, punctuation, and spelling errors. (MMR, MMAE)

## Closing and Assessment

### A. Pair Share (5 minutes)

- Invite students to take their informative paragraphs and find a partner who they have not yet worked with.
- Invite students to each read their newly revised and edited informational paragraph aloud for their partner.

**Meeting Students' Needs**

- To reinforce the learning targets, have students first explain the changes that they made to their paragraph as a result of the peer feedback they received. (MMAE)
- For ELLs and students who may need additional support with expressive language: Provide dialogue to help students decide who would like to share first. (MMR, MMAE) Example:
  - "Would you like to share first?"
  - "Yes, I would" or "No, thanks, I would prefer to go second."

**Homework**

---

**A. Respond to an informative writing prompt in your Unit 2 homework.**

**B. Accountable Research Reading. Select a prompt and respond in the front of your independent reading journal.**

**Meeting Students' Needs**

- For ELLs and students who may need additional support with writing: Discuss and respond to your prompts orally, either with a partner, family member, or student from grades 1 or 2, or record a response. (MMAE)