

Lesson 4: Comparing Two Texts and Shared Writing: Why People Should Protect Bats



CCS Standards

- **RI.2.8:** Describe how reasons support specific points the author makes in a text.
- **RI.2.9:** Compare and contrast the most important points presented by two texts on the same topic.
- **W.2.1:** Write opinion pieces in which they introduce the topic or book they are writing about, state an opinion, supply reasons that support the opinion, use linking words (e.g., because, and, also) to connect opinion and reasons, and provide a concluding statement or section
- **L.2.1b:** Form and use frequently occurring irregular plural nouns (e.g., feet, children, teeth, mice, fish).



Daily Learning Targets

- I can compare and contrast *A Place for Bats* with “Bats’ Roosts in Danger!” (RI.2.9)
- I can plan the introduction and focus statement for a shared opinion piece about why people should work to protect bats. (W.2.1)

Ongoing Assessment

- After the lesson, use the Reading Informational Text Checklist to review students’ Protecting Pollinators research notebook and track progress toward RI.2.9 (see Assessment Overview and Resources).

Agenda

- 1. Opening**
 - A. Engaging the Learner: “The Butterfly Garden” (10 minutes)
- 2. Work Time**
 - A. Comparing and Contrasting Texts on the Same Topic: Bats (20 minutes)
 - B. Shared Writing: Planning an Opinion Piece about Why People Should Protect Bats (10 minute)
 - C. Shared Writing: Writing an Introduction and Focus Statement (15 minutes)
- 3. Closing and Assessment**
 - A. Vote with Your Feet Protocol: Comparing Two Texts (5 minutes)

Teaching Notes

Purpose of lesson and alignment to standards:

- In the Opening, students develop their understanding of regular and irregular plural nouns using the poem “The Butterfly Garden.” Exploring this aspect of grammar is relevant because students apply this understanding as they write about bats (a regular plural noun), and butterflies (an irregular plural noun) during this unit.
- In Work Time A, students work to compare and contrast the two texts they have read on the topic of bats: *A Place for Bats* and “Bats’ Roosts in Danger!” Analyzing texts on the same topic supports students’ ability to understand points made by different authors. It also supports the development of students’ reading and research skills in understanding the importance of accessing multiple sources for research and note-taking to confirm findings.
- In this lesson, students participate in their first of two shared writing sessions to craft an opinion piece about why people should protect bats. One key aspect of opinion writing as it unfolds through the CCSS is to clearly support opinions with reasons based on research. The central purpose of opinion writing in this lesson, and unit, is to support opinions with reasons based on research. Students write about the same opinion in order to focus their learning on the craft of opinion writing, as a scaffold to help them learn how to develop and communicate their own informed opinions in the future.

How this lesson builds on previous work:

- Students compare two texts that they read in Lessons 2–3. This also builds on student learning from Unit 1, when they compared and contrasted fables based on similar stories.
- During the shared opinion writing in Work Time C, students use their existing knowledge of paragraph structure to develop their understanding of the structure for a multi-paragraph opinion piece and to prepare for writing expectations in Grade 3.

Areas in which students may need additional support:

- During Work Time A, some students may require additional teacher support in skimming text to determine the source for different statements. Consider working with a small, teacher-led group to provide additional direct instruction.

Down the road:

- The shared opinion piece that is co-constructed during Lessons 4–5 will be used again as a model for students to examine in Lessons 8–9. Consider previewing those lessons in advance. Careful teacher facilitation during shared writing sessions should ensure the shared piece is at a level of quality to serve as a model for analysis.
- In Grade 3, students are introduced to the Painted Essay®, a color-coding protocol that supports the planning, writing, and analysis of text structure. In this lesson, during Work Time C, the same color-coding system is used to write different parts of the shared opinion piece (red for introduction, green for focus statement, yellow and blue for supporting reasons, and black for conclusion). This not only supports student analysis of the shared opinion piece in subsequent lessons, but also previews the introduction of the color-coding protocol in third grade. Additionally, writing a multi-paragraph opinion piece increases the rigor of writing expectations for second-graders and prepares them to meet the demands of third grade.

In advance:

- Preview Work Time C and Shared Opinion Writing: “People Should Protect Bats” (example, for teacher reference) to familiarize yourself with the outcomes for shared writing (see supporting materials).
- Pre-distribute copies *A Place for Bats* and Protecting Pollinators research notebooks at student workspaces for Work Time A.
- Post: Learning targets and all applicable anchor charts (see materials list).

Technology & Multimedia

Consider using an interactive white board or document camera to display lesson materials.

- During the shared writing in Work Time C, consider the use of tablets and streaming technology instead of white boards and dry-erase markers, allowing the display of students’ writing ideas for discussion, revision, and inclusion in the shared writing piece.

Supporting English Language Learners

Supports guided by in part by CA ELD Standards 2.I.B.7, 2.I.C.10, and 2.II.B.4

Important points in the lesson itself

- The basic design of this lesson supports ELLs with multiple opportunities to orally process their ideas with peers and to participate in a shared writing experience similar to the writing required on their forthcoming Unit 2 Assessment.
- ELLs may find it challenging to skim each text for specific information as they compare and contrast two different texts. Consider offering additional models and think-alouds to support students with this activity. Make the task more manageable by limiting the amount of information each student is responsible for finding (see Meeting Students’ Needs).

Levels of support

For lighter support

- During Work Time A, give students roles to support their partner work (examples: reader, recorder).

For heavier support

- During Work Time A, consider working closely with a small group of students to compare and contrast texts as a guided activity.

Universal Design for Learning

- **Multiple Means of Representation (MMR):** In this lesson, students are introduced to the poem “The Butterfly Garden.” Some students may benefit from having an individual copy of the poem to follow along in near-point as it is read aloud. Support transfer of learning by offering multiple representations of the poem. Consider providing an annotated or illustrated copy of the poem for students as support for information-processing strategy development and comprehension.
- **Multiple Means of Action and Expression (MMAE):** In this lesson, students are invited to chorally read the poem aloud. Some students may not feel confident in their reading skills and may benefit from modeling and supported practice. Provide differentiated mentors by seating students who may be more confident reading aloud near students who may not feel as confident.
- **Multiple Means of Engagement (MME):** Invite students to reflect on their learning from previous lessons in this unit to help students understand the value and relevance of the activities in this lesson. Continue to provide prompts and sentence frames for those who require them.

Vocabulary

Key:

(L): Lesson-Specific Vocabulary

(T): Text-Specific Vocabulary

(W): Vocabulary Used in Writing

New:

- irregular (L)

Review:

- noun, singular, plural noun, compare, contrast, introduction, opinion (L)

Materials

- ✓ “The Butterfly Garden” (new; teacher-created; see supporting materials)
- ✓ “The Butterfly Garden” (example, for teacher reference)
- ✓ Comparing Two Texts about Bats anchor chart (new; co-created with students during Work Time A; see supporting materials)
- ✓ Comparing Two Texts about Bats anchor chart (example, for teacher reference)
- ✓ “Bats’ Roosts in Danger!” (from Lesson 3; one to display; for teacher read-aloud)
- ✓ *A Place for Bats* (from Lesson 1; one per pair and one to display; for teacher read-aloud)
- ✓ Protecting Pollinators research notebook (from Lesson 3; added to during Work Time A; one per student)
 - “Bats’ Roosts in Danger!” (from Lesson 3; page 2 of the Protecting Pollinators research notebook)
 - Comparing Two Texts about Bats (page 4 of the notebook)

- ✓ Protecting Pollinators research notebook (from Lesson 3; example, for teacher reference)
- ✓ Dangers That Bats Face and Reasons Bats Are Important: Class Notes (completed in Lesson 3; one to display)
- ✓ Chart paper (two pieces; used by the teacher for shared writing)
- ✓ Shared Opinion Writing: “People Should Protect Bats” (example, for teacher reference)
- ✓ Markers (permanent; red and green; one of each used by the teacher for shared writing)
- ✓ Vote with Your Feet Protocol anchor chart (begun in Lesson 2)

Opening

A. Engaging the Learner: “The Butterfly Garden” (10 minutes)

- Gather students whole group, directing them to sit with their research partners.
- Remind them that they have been researching bats, but that they have learned and care about many different pollinators. Display **“The Butterfly Garden.”** With excitement, tell students that you have a new poem to share with them about pollinators: butterflies!
- Read aloud the poem, cuing students to look and listen to discover different pollinators that are referenced in the poem.
- Using a total participation technique, invite responses from the group:
“What is the poem about?” (a garden with butterflies and bats; children helping butterflies by planting things)
- Confirm that the poem is about a garden with butterflies and bats in it, and children who are helping the butterflies by planting flowers.
- Remind students that the words *bats* and *butterflies* are both *plural nouns*, and that the class has learned about plural nouns in previous units. Review the meaning of *nouns* (name a person, place, or thing) and *plural nouns* (name groups of people, places, or things) as needed.
- Say:
“We’ll be writing opinions about bats and butterflies in this unit, so it’s important that we learn to write about them accurately. This will help you as writers in this unit, but also in your future as authors of many types of text.”
- Refocus students’ attention on the words *bats* and *butterflies*. Tell them that one is an *irregular plural noun*. Define *irregular* (not following the general rules of grammar or spelling).
- At the bottom of the poem, write the headings “regular plural nouns” and “irregular plural nouns.” Refer to **“The Butterfly Garden” (example, for teacher reference)** as necessary.
- Referring to the heading “regular plural nouns,” share that the rule for writing regular plural nouns is to simply add -s or -es to a noun. Under the heading, write “only add -s or -es.”
- Using a total participation technique, invite responses from the group:
“What are some examples of regular plural nouns in the poem?” (trees, bats, caves, collectors, protectors, bushes)
- Underline student examples in the poem and write them on “The Butterfly Garden” under the heading.

- Using a total participation technique, invite responses from the group:
“What are some examples of regular plural nouns that you have heard or read, but not in this poem?” (Responses will vary.)
- As students share out, capture their responses on “The Butterfly Garden.”
- Referring to the heading “irregular plural nouns,” share that when plural nouns are formed in any way other than adding *-s* or *-es*, they are considered *irregular* because they do not follow the rule. Note that the prefix *ir-* means not (for example, the word *irresponsible* means not responsible). Write “anything other than adding *-s*, *-es*” under the heading with a few examples of common irregular nouns (examples: geese, women).
- Repeat the process of underlining and adding examples of irregular plural nouns in the poem to “The Butterfly Garden” (butterfly/butterflies, berry/berries, cherry/cherries, child/children), as well as examples that do not show up in the poem (e.g., mouse/mice, foot/feet, tooth/teeth, person/people).
- Referring to the posted rules for and examples of regular and irregular plural nouns, explain that this is often confusing and is something students will get better at the more they work at it. Tell students that they can use the poem and listed regular and irregular plural nouns as a tool to support them while writing opinions during this unit.
- Invite students to chorally read the poem aloud. Tell them that like comparing two types of plural nouns, today they will use their reading and thinking skills to compare two texts on the same topic.

Meeting Students' Needs

- For ELLs and students who may need additional support with vocabulary: (Grammar Practice: Plural Nouns) Provide a few sentence frames so students can notice how using plural nouns and singular nouns affects determiners. Examples:
 - “I saw a _____ pollinating a _____.”
 - “I saw some _____ pollinating many _____.” (MMR)
- For students who may need additional support with comprehension: Consider using different colors to underline and circle regular and irregular plural nouns in the poem. (Example: Underline regular plural nouns with green, and circle irregular plural nouns with pink.) (MMR)

Work Time

A. Comparing and Contrasting Texts on the Same Topic: Bats (20 minutes)

- Refocus students whole group.
- Direct their attention to the posted learning targets, and read the first one aloud:
“I can compare and contrast A Place for Bats with ‘Bats’ Roosts in Danger!”
- Tell students that as they compared and contrasted fables in the previous unit, they can compare and contrast informational texts on the same topic to analyze the points made in either, or both, texts.

- Direct students' attention to the **Comparing Two Texts about Bats anchor chart** and tell students they will consider four points made by the authors of the two texts and determine which text each point belongs to. Share that they will consider each point one at a time.
 - Students will skim each text to see if it contains the point they are considering. If it does, they will make an “X” on the chart under the correct title.
 - Students will repeat this step for each point listed on the chart.
 - Confirm that some points may appear in both texts, and that if they do, students may make an “X” under both titles to indicate that the point is made in both texts.
 - Tell students that you will model this for them with the first point on the chart.
- Model this process for students using the first point on the chart.
 - Read the first point aloud:
 - “People make choices that affect bats.”
 - Say:

“I want to find out which text includes the point that people make choices that affect bats. I’ll need to skim both texts.”
 - Display **“Bats’ Roosts in Danger!”** and say:
 - “When I skim the text, I don’t have to read every word. I can read the first and last sentence in each paragraph to see if I might need to read one of the paragraphs more completely.”
 - “I need to remember that I am looking for the point that people make choices that affect bats.”
 - Read aloud the first and last sentence from Paragraph 1 in “Bats’ Roosts in Danger!”
 - Say:

“The last sentence makes the point that people can help bats by saving bats’ roosts.” It says that they can help, but not that they have to. This makes me think that it is a person’s choice whether or not they help save bats’ roosts. I can make an ‘X’ for this point under the title ‘Bats’ Roosts in Danger!’ on the Comparing Two Texts about Bats anchor chart.”
 - Next to the point “people make choices that affect bats,” place a check mark in the column for “Bats’ Roosts in Danger!” on the Comparing Two Texts about Bats anchor chart. Refer to **Comparing Two Texts about Bats anchor chart (example, for teacher reference)** as necessary.
 - Point out that you must also skim *A Place for Bats* to see if that book makes the same point, or if the point was only made in “Bats’ Roosts in Danger!”
 - Display **A Place for Bats** and say: “This book has more pages to skim, but I remember that there are only one or two sentences at the top of each page. There are also pictures that might help me skim for the point I am seeking.”
 - Read aloud the first sentences on pages 1–2 of *A Place for Bats*. Say:

“On page 2, it says that we can work together to help bats, but it doesn’t say that we already do work together to help bats. That means we can choose to work together if we want to. This book also makes the point that people make choices that affect bats.”
 - Make an “X” next to the point “people make choices that affect bats” under the column for *A Place for Bats* to indicate that the point is made in this text, too.

- Transition students to their workspaces with their partners and point out the copies of *A Place for Bats* and their **Protecting Pollinators research notebooks already there**.
- Refer students to the Table of Contents in their research notebook to find “Bats’ Roosts in Danger!” (page 2) and **Comparing Two Texts about Bats** (page 4).
- Invite students to begin comparing the two texts, circulating to support them as they skim, read, discuss, and mark their answers. Refer to **Protecting Pollinators research notebook (example, for teacher reference)** as necessary.
- When 5 minutes remain, direct students to leave their research notebooks at their workspaces and to return to the whole group area.
- Direct students’ attention to the Comparing Two Texts about Bats anchor chart to complete the chart as a class. Review each point on the chart and invite students to share their thinking about the text(s) to which the statement belongs. Refer to Comparing Two Texts about Bats anchor chart (example, for teacher reference) as necessary.
- Tell students they will use a similar chart when they compare points made in two texts about butterflies on the Unit 2 Assessment, Part I during Lesson 6.

Meeting Students’ Needs

- For ELLs and students who may need additional support with strategy development: (Jigsaw Reading) Consider making this task more manageable for students by allowing two groups to work together. Each group would compare and contrast two of the four categories. With a few minutes of independent work remaining, the two groups can share their Comparing Two Texts about Bats charts with each other. (MMAE, MME)
- For ELLs and students who may need additional support with organizing ideas for expression: (Language for Comparing and Contrasting) To support student discussion, consider reviewing and practicing phrases and sentence frames for comparing and contrasting. (Example: “____ and ____ are similar because ____.”) (MMAE)

Work Time

B. Shared Writing: Planning an Opinion Piece about Why People Should Protect Bats (10 minutes)

- Direct students’ attention to the posted learning targets and read the second one aloud:

“I can plan the introduction and focus statement for a shared opinion piece about why people should work to protect bats.”
- Referring to copies of *A Place for Bats* and “Bats’ Roosts in Danger!”, briefly remind students that these two texts contain opinions about bats. Name the opinion evident in each text. Say:

“The author in A Place for Bats shares the opinion that people sometimes do things that make it hard for bats to live and grow.”

“The rest of the book gives many reasons why the author has this opinion. She gives many examples of the things people have done that make it hard for bats to live and grow.”

- Refer to “Bats’ Roosts in Danger!” and say:
“The author of ‘Bats’ Roosts in Danger!’ shares the opinion that bats’ roosts are in danger from choices made by people.”
“The rest of the piece gives reasons why people’s choices put bats’ roosts in danger.”
“Both authors offer their opinion and then support their opinion with reasons. Today, we will write our own opinion piece, as a class, about bats. We will tell our opinion and support it with reasons.”
- Direct students’ attention to the **Dangers That Bats Face and Reasons Bats Are Important: Class Notes**, and acknowledge that students have become knowledgeable about this topic by reading, discussing, and recording notes.
- Say:
“Our class is working to write an opinion piece that is based on reasons, just like the authors did. In order to help everyone learn how to support an opinion with reasons, the class will work together to write about the same opinion on the topic of bats. We can write to support an opinion using our knowledge from research, even if we disagree with the opinion. Writing to support opinions, even when we disagree, helps us understand other perspectives, teaches us to be open-minded, and helps us better form our own opinion.”
- Post two pieces of **chart paper** on the board, side by side. Explain that this is where we will create our shared opinion piece. Ask:
“Are you curious about what opinion we will be writing about?” (Responses will vary.)
- With an element of dramatic secrecy, write and then reveal the opinion as the title on the first sheet of blank chart paper: “People Should Protect Bats.”
- Choose a physical signal for students to show if they agree or disagree with the opinion that people should protect bats (agree: two thumbs high up; disagree: arms in the shape of an “X”).

Meeting Students’ Needs

- For ELLs and students who may need additional support with motivation: (Transparency) To ensure that the purpose of providing reasons for an opinion is transparent, cue students to problem-solve: “Can you figure out why giving reasons for an opinion is important?” Tell students you will give them time to think and discuss with their partner. (Responses will vary, but could include: to tell others why you have that opinion; to get others to agree with your opinion.) (MME)
- For ELLs: (Collocation) Say: “The word *support* is often used with the word *opinion* and can be learned and used together as a phrase (collocation). To *support an opinion* means to give reasons or facts to explain why the opinion makes sense.” Provide the following examples:
 - “I can support my opinion about ____.”
 - “The author did not support her opinions about ____.”

Work Time

B. Shared Writing: Writing an Introduction and Focus Statement (15 minutes)

- Refocus whole group, and invite students to move to sit with their research partners if they aren't already. Say:

“Look at your research partner. Can you see a change happening? It may not look like much, but at this moment you are all beginning to make a shift in your mind from research reading and note-taking to ... writing! It's invisible, but it's an important change!”

“We have learned a lot about writing this year. You probably know more about writing than you do about bats, and you know a lot about bats! First, we will need to access your memories for information about writing paragraphs.”

- Ask:

“What is the first part of a paragraph called—the part that the reader reads first?” (introduction)

- Confirm that the introduction briefly explains the topic or issue. Ask:

“What is our topic?” (bats)

“What have we learned about bats?” (They are in danger.)

- Explain that students will orally “write” an introduction with their writing partners.

- Holding one hand out flat like a piece of paper and the other hand with a pointing index finger as a pencil, tell students that they can pretend to write as they talk with their partners to brainstorm sentences for our shared introduction.

- Turn and Talk:

“You know a lot about why bats are in danger. What can we write in our introduction to briefly explain this issue to readers?” (Responses will vary, but may include: Bats are in danger; bats are helpful creatures.)

- Encourage students to refer to the class notes as needed.
- Listen in for examples to highlight with the whole group that align with the introduction to **Shared Opinion Writing: “People Should Protect Bats” (example for teacher reference)**.

- Refocus whole group. Using a red **marker**, but without explaining the color-coding system, write the co-created introduction on the chart paper for shared writing.

- Ask:

“What comes after the introduction?” (focus statement)

- Point out that the focus statement is where authors state their opinion.

- Ask:

“What are two main reasons we've researched that tell why we should protect bats?” (important to plants; important to other animals)

- Invite students to orally “write” with their partners once more using their “pencil” (finger) and “paper” (hand). Turn and Talk:

“What sentences can we write for our focus statement to share our opinion on this issue and connect it to our reasons?” (Responses will vary.)

- Continue to listen in for examples to highlight with the whole group that align with the introduction to Shared Opinion Writing: “People Should Protect Bats” (example for teacher reference).
- Refocus whole group, highlighting student responses to write the focus statement. Using a green marker, and again without explaining the color-coding system, write the shared focus statement as the end of the introductory paragraph.
 - Be sure to include the linking word because in the sentence to incorporate the two main supporting reasons for the opinion as evident in the class notes: because bats are important to plants and other animals.
- Invite students to read the shared opinion piece chorally with you.
- Point out that students used their strengths as writers to help each other grow as authors of a shared opinion piece.
- Share that in the next lesson, students will work together to complete the shared opinion writing about why bats should be protected.

Meeting Students' Needs

- For ELLs: (Cold Calling) Cold call a few ELLs to share their ideas during the shared writing activity to provide leadership opportunities and to check for comprehension.
- For students who may need additional support with organizing their thinking for verbal expression: Before inviting students to Turn and Talk, consider giving time to think and process the questions. (MMAE, MME)

Closing and Assessment

A. Vote with Your Feet Protocol: Comparing Two Texts (5 minutes)

- Tell students they will now participate in the Vote with Your Feet protocol. Remind them that they used this protocol in Lessons 2–3 and review as necessary using the **Vote with Your Feet Protocol anchor chart**. (Refer to the Classroom Protocols document for the full version of the protocol.)
 - Guide students through the protocol using the following prompt:
“Which text helped you build more knowledge to write our introduction and focus statement: ‘Bats’ Roosts in Danger!’ or A Place for Bats?”
 - Once students have moved to indicate their response, Turn and Talk:
“Share one reason to support your answer choice.” (Responses will vary, depending on choice.)
- Refocus whole group and preview tomorrow’s work by sharing that students will co-create detail sentences about the reasons supporting our shared opinion, and begin research about dangers facing another pollinator: butterflies!

Meeting Students' Needs

- For students who may need additional support with working memory: Provide the question and a minute of think time to students before voting. (MMAE)